BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY
3 1761 09564705 3

UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO
FACULTY OF LAW

MEDIA AND DEFAMATION LAW

(LAW 369H1S)

Bert Bruser and Paul Schabas

CASES AND MATERIALS

(2013 – 2014)

VOLUME I

STORAGE

KE
1246
.B78
2013
v.1
c.1

BORA LASKIN LAW LIBRARY

JAN 15 2014

FACULTY OF LAW
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO

MEDIA AND DEFAMATION LAW

(LAW 369H1S)

Bert Bruser and Paul Schabas

CASES AND MATERIALS

(2013 – 2014)

VOLUME I

21827281.7

Digitized by the Internet Archive
in 2018 with funding from
University of Toronto

https://archive.org/details/mediadefamationl01brus_6

MEDIA AND DEFAMATION LAW

(LAW 369H1S)

Bert Bruser and Paul Schabas

CASES AND MATERIALS

(2013-2014)

CONTENTS **PAGE**

VOLUME I - LIBEL

1. What is defamatory and who can sue? 1
Robertson & Nicol, *Media Law* (excerpts) 2
"Some in Huntsville 'getting nervous'" 9
Youssoupoff v. Metro-Goldwyn-Mayer Pictures Ltd (1934), 50 T.L.R. 581 (C.A.) 12
"Why are so many gays still hiding in the closet?" 17
"Correction: Columnist meant to say singer supports equality" 18
"Racial slur rocks Liberal candidate" 19
"'Son of a bitch' not libellous; 'sick son of a bitch' is" 20
"Nic At Nite: A tale of hooters and heifers in old Hogtown" 21
"Order your drink and duck, dope" 28
"Dorothy Parsons clenched the sink" 29
Middlebrooks v. Curtis Publishing Co., 413 F. 2d 141 30
Lewis v. Daily Telegraph Ltd., [1963] 2 All ER 151 33
"Canada slow to accept Haitian rape risk" 41
"Singled out" 44
Gauthier v. Toronto Star (2003), 228 D.L.R (4th) 748 (Ont. Sup. Ct.), aff'd (2004) 45 D.L.R. (4th) 169 (Ont. C.A.) 46
Malhab v. Diffusion Metromedia CMR Inc., 2011 SCC 9 (excerpts) 53
"Tenants seek ouster of priest, directors" 73

2. Defences to Libel 74
(a) Truth/Justification 75
"Police chief for Niagara not picked: Commission" 76
Sidorsky v. CFCN Communications Ltd (1994), 23 Alta. L.R. (3d) 116 (Q.B.) (excerpts) 77
PG Restaurant Ltd v. Northern Interior Health Board, 2005 BCCA 210 78

(b) Fair Comment 91
Excerpt from *Toronto Star* column by Joey Slinger 92
"Paradise lost at Passe Muraille – First-night theatre-goers says things went all to pot" 93
Transcript of CKNW broadcast, October 25, 1999 94

WIC Radio, et al. v. Kari Simpson, 2008 SCC 40 96
"Conspiracy" cartoon by Josh Beutel 120
"Mayor Tremblay's Family Photos" 121
Eye Weekly, July 23 and 30, 1998 122
"What Toronto Mayor Rob Ford said about the Boardwark Café deal" 124
Foulidis v. Ford, [2012] O.J. No. 6152 127
"Killer was drawn to others' online rage," *Toronto Star*, July 29, 2011 145
"Melanie Phillips Apology," *Toronto Star*, Aug. 26, 2011 146
Mainstream Canada, a Division of EWOS Canada Ltd. v. Staniford, [2013] B.C.J. No. 1571 ..147

(c) Privilege 166
"Developer ordered to clean up land near houses" 167
"Woman sues orphanage nuns" 168
"Executive sold secrets to CIA" 169
"Reodica" article 170
McCarton Turkington Breen v. Times Newspapers, [2001] 2 AC 277 172

(d) Qualified Privilege and Responsible Communication 181
RTC Engineering Consultants Ltd. v. Ontario (Solicitor General) 58 O.R. (3d) 726 [2002] O.J. No. 1001 182
New York Times Co. v Sullivan, 376 U.S. 254 (1964) 190
Hill v. Church of Scientology, [1995] 2 S.C.R. 1130 (excerpts) 216
"Saudi Officials Monitor Certain Bank Accounts – Focus is on Those With Potential Terrorist Ties", *Wall Street Journal*, Feb. 6, 2002 250
Jameel v. Wall Street Journal, [2007] 1 AC 359 252
Grant v. Torstar Corp., 2009 SCC 61 276
Flood v. Times Newspapers Ltd., UKSC 21 March 2012 307
Prince Radu of Hohenzollern v. Marco Houston and Sena Julia Publicatus Ltd., [2007] EWHC 2735 (QB) (excerpts) 356
"Adam Giambrone says sorry for relationship with young woman" 369
"Former MP Rahim Jaffer connected to alleged conman" 371
Nazim Gillani Libel Notice 375
"Ruby Dhalla's nanny trouble" 378
"Conviction tossed out over 'police brutality'" 381
"Officer breaks 'little' accountant's arm, but no charges laid" 384
"BBC in turmoil…" 387
"Rob Ford told he was unwelcome as a football coach at Toronto high school," *Toronto Star*, July 13, 2010 390
"Mayor Rob Ford to Toronto: Don't read the Star," *Toronto Star*, December 2, 2011 392
"For Sale: A Video of Toronto Mayor Rob Ford Smoking Crack Cocaine (http://gawker.com/for-sale-a-video-of-toronto-mayor-rob-ford-smoking-cra-507736569)" 394
"Rob Ford in 'crack cocaine' video scandal," *Toronto Star,* May 16, 2013 398
"Globe investigation" The Ford family's history with drug dealing," *The Globe and Mail*, May 25, 2013 402
"OPC Decision: Donley Vs Toronto Star, October 2013," *Ontario Press Council* *409*
"OPC Decision: Harrison Vs Globe And Mail, October 2013," *Ontario Press Council* 414

"If Rob Ford sues ex-staffers, he'll lose," *Toronto Star,* November 16, 2013 420
Walsh Energy Inc. (c.o.b. The Energy Centre) v. Better Business Bureau of Ottawa-Hull Inc. (c.o.b. Better Business Bureau Serving Eastern and Northern Ontario and the Outaouais), [2012] O.J. No. 6081 423

3. Malice 437
Horrocks v. Lowe, [1975] AC 135 (HL) 438
Paul v. Cheng, [2000] HKCFA 88 447

4. Apologies/Corrections 463
Murray Alter's Talent Associates Ltd. v. Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd., [1995] 124 D.L.R. (4th) 105 (Ont. Div. Ct.) 464
Sun Media Retraction and Apology to George Soros 480
"Disgraced Local 183 union executive…" 481

5. Damages 482
Walker v. CFTO Ltd. (1987), 59 OR (2d) 104 (C.A.) 483
Skene, Canadian Defamation Verdicts (to Sept. 1, 2012) 495

6. Defamation and the Internet 497
Bunt v. Tilley, [2006] EWHC 407 (QB) 498
United States *Communications Decency Act*, 47 U.S.C. § 230 (excerpt) 506
Carter v. B.C. Federation of Foster Parents Assn. [2004] B.C.J. No. 192 (Sup Ct.)(excerpts) 507
Carter v. B.C. Federation of Foster Parents Assn. [2005] B.C.J. No. 1720 (C.A.) (excerpts) 512
Times Newspapers (Nos. 1 and 2) v. U.K., [2009] ECHR 3002/03 514
Crookes v. Newton, 2011 SCC 47 (excerpts) 526
Barrick Gold Corp. v. Lopehandia, [2004] O.J. No. 2329 (C.A.) (excerpts) 541
Baglow v. Smith, 2011 ONSC 5131 548
Baglow v. Smith, [2012] O.J. No. 2668 (C.A.) 563
Shtaif v. Toronto Life Publishing Co. Ltd., 2013 ONCA 405 565
Smith v. ADVFN plc, [2008] EWHC 1797 (QB) (excerpts) 599
"Internet chat more likely slander than libel, says High Court" 601
"Mosley orgy judge blocks web forum libel writ onslaught" 603
"Rats Feast at Dumpling House" 606
Public message board on www.blogto.com website 608
Public message board on *Toronto Star* website (screenshot) 613
"'Officer Bubbles' launches suit against YouTube" 614
"Helping towns cope with sprawl" 615
"The longtail of news: to unpublish or not to unpublish" 617
Metropolitan International Schools Ltd. v. Google. et al., [2009] EWHC 1765 (QB) (excerpts) 639
"Google hit with $200,000 damages…" 657
"Former German First Lady Sues Google…" 659
Dow Jones & Co. v. Gutnick (2002), 210 C.L.R. 575 (HCA) 661
Black v. Breeden, [2012] SCJ No. 19 681
Editions Ecosociété Inc. v. Banro Corp., 2012 SCC 18 693

"Haaretz.com" 693
U.S. *SPEECH Act,* H.R. 2765 (2010) 700
"A national disgrace, a global menace, and a pre-democratic anachronism" 704
"Libel Without Borders" 707

7. Legislation 708
Libel and Slander Act, R.S.O. 1990, c. L.12 709
United Kingdom Defamation Act 2013 714

VOLUME II – PRIVACY AND NEWSGATHERING

8. Privacy 726
Vice-Versa magazine, June 1988 727
Jones v. Tsige, 2012 ONCA 32 728
Royal Family Photos 769
Mosley v. News Group Newspapers, [2008] EWHC 1777 (QB) (excerpts) 771
"Max Mosley goes forum shopping in Paris," *The Independent*, 4 June 2008 782
"Google ordered to erase all sex images of F1 chief Mosley," *Toronto Star,* 6, November, 2013 784
"Google Street View worries privacy experts" 785
"Google contravened Canadian privacy law, investigation finds," Office of the Privacy Commissioner of Canada 787
"Seniors at risk in retirement home, investigation reveals" 790
"Keeping secrets in the age of tweets," *The Economist*, May 26, 2011 793

9. Open Courts 796
Edmonton Journal v. Alberta, [1989] 2 S.C.R. 1326 797

10. Publication Bans 814
"Gagged" (Tori Stafford murder case) 815
"The criminal case you can't know about," *Toronto Star*, Nov. 2, 2011 817
"Experts shocked by publication ban," *Toronto Star*, Nov. 3, 2011 819
"Karla Teale convicted" 820
Dagenais v. CBC, [1994] 3 S.C.R. 835 822
R. v. Mentuck, 2001 SCC 76 838
Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd. v. Ontario, 2005 SCC 41 855
Toronto Star Newspapers Ltd. v. Canada, 2010 SCC 21 863
"Respected teacher had 'dark side,' court told – Kingston man faces sex charges" 878
"How sex-attack case faltered," and apology 879
"Claim allowed to proceed over breach of publication ban" 880
Jan Wong, "On naming names in sexual assault" 881
"Abuse, rape uncovered in nursing homes," *Toronto Star*, Nov. 17, 2011 882
"[Redacted]: 1 Year Probation for Manslaughter – 2009 draft pick [redacted] talks to Point Blank" 885
R. v. Kossyrine & Vorobiov, 2011 ONSC 6081 888
M.E.H. v. Russell Williams, 2012 ONCA 35 895

A.B. v. Bragg Communications Inc., [2012] S.C.O. No. 46 922
"Guidance Document: Electronic Disclosure of Personal Information in the Decisions of Administrative Tribunals," *Office of the Privacy Commissioner*, February 2010 930
"Reflections on Privacy from the Bench," *Office of the Privacy Commissioner* 935

11. Access 942
"Justice is blind, and in Ontario, it's also becoming mute" 943
R. v. Canadian Broadcasting Corporation, 2010 ONCA 726 945
Correctional Service of Canada v. Dr. John R. Carlisle, 2012 ONSC 6080 955
Canadian Broadcasting Corp. v. The Queen, 2011 SCC 3 (excerpts) 962
Ontario (Public Safety and Security) v. Criminal Lawyers' Association, 2010 SCC 23 970
Order of the Information and Privacy Commissioner of Ontario – Human Rights Tribunal of Ontario, October 21, 2010 986
Ontario (Minister of Finance) v. Ontario (Information and Privacy Commissioner), 2012 ONCA 125 999
"Investigation into a Secret Court: Here's what we found," *Toronto Star*, Oct. 29, 2011 1006
Toronto Star v. Ontario, [2012] O.J. No. 198 1008
The Globe and Mail and Others v. HMQ, 2013 ONSC 6836 1028
Canadian Broadcasting Corporation and Others v. HMQ, 2013 ONSC 6983 1036
"Access to exhibits still denied, media lawyers say," *Law Times,* October 17, 2011 1043

12. Contempt 1044
Bert Bruser, "Often my views are unpopular" 1045
"A 25 year old drifter" 1046
"Seasoned police officers" 1047
"It was an easy arrest" 1048
"The Toronto police officer" 1049
"Cocaine Trial Begins" 1050
"Dad faces retrial in baby death" 1051
"2 suspects charged in slaying of boy, 11" 1052
"Suspect 'well-known' to police" 1053

13. Sources and Search Warrants 1054
Reid v. Telegram Publishing Co., [1961] OR 418 (S.C.) 1055
CBC c. Lessard, [1991] 3 S.C.R. 421 1062
"Judith Miller Goes to Jail" 1072
"White House proposes changes in bill protecting reporters' confidentiality" 1076
"Untangling the News of the World scandal: A Timeline," *National Post*, July 15, 2011 1078
"Ignore 'misleading' reports, U.K. phone hacking jury warned," *Toronto Star,* 29 Oct. 2013 ..1081
"Star investigation: Slacking off gets high marks at this 'high school,'" *Toronto Star*, Sept. 16, 2011 1082
"Dealing With Assange and the WikiLeaks Secrets," *NYT Magazine*, Jan. 26, 2011 1086
"NSA files: why the Guardian in London destroyed hard drives of leaked files," *The Guardian*, 20 Aug, 2013 1104
R. v. National Post, 2010 SCC 16 1106
Globe and Mail v. Canada (A.G.), 2010 SCC 41 1134

"Press freedom weighs heavily in confidential-source cases," *Globe and Mail,* 31 Mar 2013....1155
Contempt of Court Act (United Kingdom), 1981 c.49, section 10 1156

14. Copyright and Fair Use....1158
Copyright Act, s. 29.2 1159
Society of Composers and Music Publishers of Canada v. Bell Canada, 2012 SCC 36....1160
"Saturday Night", November 1985....1169
Allen v. Toronto Star, (1997), 152 D.L.R. (4th) 518 1170

15. Statutory Provisions....1177
Criminal Code, excerpts 1178
Courts of Justice Act, excerpts. 1185